

Transnational Education in Germany

DAAD Position Paper



DAAD Position Paper¹

1. What is transnational education? – A definition	3
2. Background to increased demand for TNE	4
3. The German TNE approach	5
4. Types of TNE activity	7
5. What is German about these projects? — Features of the connection with Germany	9
6. What are the benefits of ‘education export’ ...?	10
a. ... for German universities?	10
b. ... for foreign partners?	12
c. ... for Germany?	12
7. The future of TNE	14
8. Key performance criteria for the success of TNE projects	15
9. The role of the DAAD	18
Annotations	21

Whilst the 1990s were the decade of student mobility, the beginning of the 21st century has been shaped by the idea that education itself should become mobile. Australian and British universities broke the ground, actively pursuing transnational education from the end of the 1980s. In Germany, the German Academic Exchange Service (DAAD) started to systematically promote transnational education in 2001, supported by the Federal Ministry of Education and Research (BMBF).

The coalition agreement signed by the governing parties in 2009 seeks to intensify the internationalisation of German universities and specifically promote the ‘export’ of educational opportunities.ⁱ The current paper elucidates the DAAD’s position on the theme of transnational education.

Transnational education (TNE) refers to universities, degree courses and individual study modules which are offered abroad essentially for students from the respective host country or region, under the main academic responsibility of a university in another country.

**1. What is transnational education?
A definition**

Transnational education, borderless or cross-border education are terms that describe certain dimensions of university internationalisation. What all three have in common, although this may not be obvious at first sight, is that, so far, they have been exclusively associated with tertiary education. In practice, they usually include continuing education opportunities which are provided by universities, too. Furthermore, the concepts also embrace so-called distance or e-learning courses if the material provided is used outside the country in which the university that offers the course is located. The terms are used more or less interchangeablyⁱⁱ, although authors do tend to subsume different topics under them.ⁱⁱⁱ

The DAAD’s definition emphasises **academic responsibility**: Transnational education (TNE) refers to universities, courses and individual study modules which are offered abroad essentially for students from the respective country or region while the main academic responsibility lies with a university in another country. Academic responsibility first of all refers to contents (curricula), but typically embraces at least some of the following elements as well: German faculty; degrees awarded and quality assurance conducted by the German university. This is the understanding of transnational education on which this paper is based. The abbreviation TNE and the term ‘education export’ are used synonymously.

In ‘education export’, DAAD prioritises academic responsibility for educational contents.

Even on the basis of the above definition, **drawing a line between TNE and other forms of international university cooperation projects** can be difficult in some cases because the boundaries are blurred. Cooperation agreements on student and faculty exchange as well as agreements on jointly offered courses that provide for study periods at the partner university as fully integrated parts of the curriculum for students at both partner institutions (e.g. joint or double degrees) can clearly be excluded. However, the reverse is not necessarily the case: a joint degree does not automati-

cally imply that a project cannot be classified as TNE. If in doubt, the target group for the course should be seen as the decisive criterion.

2. Background to increased demand for TNE

In the international education and university sector there are push and pull factors at work that increase the appeal of TNE courses to universities. On the one hand, developments in higher education policy mean that universities can offer their courses abroad. On the other, there is an increase in demand for higher education, especially in emerging economies, which the countries themselves cannot meet.

The rapid development of transnational education across the globe since the beginning of the 1990s is the result of a number of factors, which are to some extent connected and/or are mutually dependent. The preponderance of English terminology in transnational education witnesses the fact that English-speaking countries were the pioneers in the field, especially Australia and the UK. The introduction of tuition fees in Australia in 1989 went hand in hand with an obligation on the universities to charge international students tuition fees that would at least cover the total average costs of their degree course^{iv}. The concurrent reduction in state funding for Australian uni-

versities reinforced the idea of using the fees paid by international students to subsidise university courses. As a consequence, universities increased their efforts to recruit international students many of whom, however, could no longer afford the rapidly increasing tuition fees. So the decision to offer courses offshore, i.e. outside of Australia, at lower cost, e.g. through employing local teaching staff, should be seen as a way of **reaching new target groups**.

The example of Australia illustrates the hope that TNE activities would produce **additional sources of income**. Similar, if not quite so pronounced, tendencies emerged at different times in other industrialised countries with well-developed education systems, such as the UK and the USA: decreasing, or at the very least more competitive, state funding of higher education goes hand in hand with growing autonomy for universities. To increase their **chances of recruiting good students**, they now use this new freedom to enhance their profiles, **position themselves internationally** and experiment with **alternative forms of higher education**.

Apart from the motives of those supplying transnational education, there are several factors that make **education import** attractive for many countries.

In knowledge societies the demand for skills and competencies amongst the workforce is growing; the number of jobs that require no, or only minimum, knowledge is continually dropping. Appreciation of the role played by education in realising individual life plans is on the increase with a concomitant increase in the demand for

higher education. Especially in emerging economies and developing countries, however, education systems are often overstretched by such extra demand, which leads to capacity bottlenecks.

Initially, this additional need led to greater demand for places at universities abroad, but capacity in the potential host countries is limited. Furthermore, immigration and residence laws may present another obstacle for foreign students, quite apart from the (higher) tuition fees and cost of living incurred in studying abroad and cultural barriers that may prevent students from seeking education in another country. In the Arab world, for example, the path to studying abroad is likely to be easier for sons than for daughters who are not willingly sent to western countries without a family chaperone. Finally, on the macro-level, many countries prefer to train their young people at home for fear their intellectual potential might emigrate permanently.

3. The German TNE approach

The factors influencing the rapid development of TNE described above also apply to the situation in Germany. However, German TNE activities differ from those of other countries in terms of approach and evolution: based on existing, successful university partnerships, joint courses and university projects have emerged that are planned and conducted by the partners collaboratively. This bottom-up approach enhances the kind of higher education relationship for which German universities are a sought-after collaborative partner in the international education sector and for which educational opportunities 'made in Germany' are in demand generally. Engineering and natural sciences, or 'small subjects' like art, music, archaeology, Egyptology etc., are seen as particular strengths of German education; they have a favourable image worldwide and enjoy positive public perception.

Courses in management and computer science can be provided at relatively low cost, and it is here that Australian, British and American universities 'export' the most. For Anglo-American 'education export' economic considerations are essential, although even here the last ten to fifteen years have seen a shift in financial expectations towards the more realistic target of breaking even.

By contrast, German TNE courses in engineering, natural science and the small subjects are more cost-intensive than those mentioned above with their bias towards cost-performance accounting. This is due to the more sophisticated facilities they require, higher key figures (students per square metre) and lower intake numbers per course. The equipment- and cost-intensive courses offered by German universities require financial support from public funding or from the private sector and cannot finance themselves from their income (tuition fees) alone. Governments, private investors and donors contribute large sums to subsidise bi-national university

Unlike Australia, the UK and the USA, German universities bank on partnership models which allow a balance of interests. Financial aspects take a back seat. Courses focus in particular on engineering and natural science subjects

Countries like Australia, the USA and the UK bank on transnational education as a way of reaching new target groups and tapping new sources of income. For their part, emerging economies and developing countries hope that education import will open up new opportunities for people to gain qualifications in their own countries.

DAAD Position Paper

projects – for example, the establishment of the German University in Cairo (GUC) in Egypt, the German-Jordanian University (GJU) in Amman, the German University of Technology (GUtech) in Oman, the Turkish-German University (TDU) in Istanbul or the German-Vietnamese University (VGU) in Ho Chi Minh City. But even in the context of less complex TNE projects, such as the study courses taught in German offered abroad, long-term support from public funding may be necessary and meaningful from the point of view of foreign science policy, foreign policy or education policy.

In terms of calculating income (tuition fees), the situation of German TNE differs from that of other providers: unlike many Anglo-Saxon and European countries, the German *Länder* do not charge tuition fees, or only very modest ones, even for foreigners. For the target group of international students, German study courses offered abroad therefore compete with studying in Germany itself in terms of costs. Whilst a Chinese student is financially much better off studying on the University of Nottingham's Ningbo Campus in China than at the parent university in the UK, the cost of living and studying in Germany is moderate in comparison. Hence the courses offered by German TNE must provide added value beyond the financial aspects and/or address special target groups and their needs. This could, for example, involve special content in the jointly planned curriculum or offers for target groups who are prevented from going abroad by cultural barriers or who wish to remain within their social networks.

German universities have been the first to establish the collaborative model of transnational education successfully in many countries throughout the world.

For these reasons, the topic of TNE was never just discussed from a financial point of view in Germany. Partnership models that take account of both partners' wishes are at the fore. In fact, the so-called foreign-backed universities^v, which have been emerging since the 1990s, can be seen as a partnership model for TNE that embraces both partners' interests. Ute Lanzendorf comes to the conclusion that foreign-backed universities require particularly close cooperation between the local founders or operators and their academic mentors from abroad.

"If foreign-backed provision works well, however, it offers an opportunity for amalgamation and adaption of different national types of teaching and higher education organization to engender truly 'transnational' higher education."^{vi}

Germany has played a pioneering role (alongside the USA) in introducing the collaborative model of TNE.^{vii} This illustrates the win-win nature of partnership solutions for both partners. It is, therefore, no exaggeration to claim that German universities have been **successful in establishing their own partnership approach in the field of transnational education.**

4. Types of TNE activity

A typology of TNE activities ultimately depends on the degree of importance which is ascribed to each of the various parameters and on the extent to which they, as a result, are used as differentiating criteria. With regard to such a complex and multi-layered phenomenon as TNE, the various categories are a useful guide even if the boundaries are hard to distinguish. On the basis of its experience so far, the DAAD has identified three types of German TNE project to which the projects supported under the programmes funded by the Federal Foreign Office and the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development can also be ascribed.

German courses abroad are the basic model: a German university runs one (or several) of its courses (Bachelor's, Master's or doctorate) at a partner university abroad. As a rule, the partner is largely responsible for providing the infrastructure as well as the staff for some of the basic teaching.

The DAAD's funding programme, "*Transnationale Bildung - Studienangebote im Ausland*" ('Transnational Education – Higher Education Projects Abroad'), was developed for this kind of TNE activity; this category also includes the "German-language degree programmes in CEE and CIS countries", the "Centres of African Excellence", the "Centres of Excellence in Research and Teaching" (that is those that offer degree courses) and projects funded under the programme "exceed - Excellence Centres for Exchange and Development".

Universities abroad with German backing: a university is established abroad according to that country's higher education legislation or on the basis of a special status. A special legal status is most likely to be granted in the case of politically triggered projects which have a model function in the respective host country.

In the international debate this model is usually referred to as a 'foreign-backed university'. Ute Lanzendorf defines a foreign-backed university as a legally (with respect to the university backing it) autonomous university that is associated with one or more 'mentor universities' abroad. The mentor university takes responsibility for curriculum development, quality assurance and continuing education for local teaching staff. It usually also delegates teaching staff to the university abroad and engages in fundraising at home. Most mentor universities are permanently represented on the committees of the foreign-backed university.^{viii}

In practice, when it comes to major or politically motivated projects of this type, several universities form a consortium under the leadership of a group representative or an organisation like the DAAD. A number of the largest German TNE projects fall into this category, such as the German University in Cairo (GUC), the German-Jordanian University (GJU) in Amman, the German-Kazakh University (DKU) in Almaty, the

In Germany, three types of TNE have emerged: German study courses abroad, German-backed universities and, to a lesser extent, affiliated or branch campuses of German universities abroad.

The affiliated campus and some other models that have established themselves on the international education market, such as validation, franchising and distance learning, have not as yet played a significant role for German universities.

German University of Technology (GUTech) in the Sultanate of Oman, the Turkish-German University (TGU) in Istanbul and the Vietnamese-German University (VGV) in Ho Chi Minh City.

An **affiliated or branch campus** is a branch of a German university abroad and thus, unlike foreign-backed universities, a foreign education institution in the respective educational landscape. Infrastructure considerations may mean that a branch is located on the campus of a national university. The parent university bears full responsibility for teaching and administration. It is merely required to observe the valid local regulations pertaining to foreign education providers (not every country allows foreign education providers to open branches). The degrees awarded are those of the German university.

This type, which prevails in Australia's TNE portfolio, is only gradually finding a place in Germany. Two examples include the engagement of the University of Erlangen-Nürnberg in Busan, Korea, and the German Institute of Science and Technology – TUM Asia (GIST-TUM Asia), a branch of Technische Universität München (TUM).

A study conducted on behalf of the DAAD by the Centre for Higher Education (CHE) in 2001 identified additional models on the international education market which, however, have not played a significant role in Germany so far:^{ix} **validation, franchising and distance learning.**^x

Validation refers to the ex-ante evaluation of a course provided by another university. Thus the institution issuing the validation does not offer its own courses abroad but grants degrees for another university's course after it has examined items such as the curriculum and quality assurance measures. According to the DAAD's narrow definition of transnational education, which is based on German conditions, this variant does not fall into the category of 'education export' because the validating university does not bear significant academic responsibility for the course.

Franchising, in contrast to validation, does actually involve 'education export'. In this case, a foreign university is entitled to offer a course 'exported' by the university in Germany and also award a degree from that university. The 'exporting' university thus carries complete responsibility for course contents. Continuing education measures for lecturers and quality assurance are essential if teaching is conducted exclusively by lecturers from the university abroad.

Distance learning, finally, is an element of some education 'export' courses and is offered as an addition (preparation, support, follow-up) to contact phases, but complete distance learning courses are not usually subsumed under the heading of transnational education in Germany. This may be because the providers are only just beginning to see themselves as international education providers. Otherwise, the University of Hagen (distance teaching university) with 5,136 students abroad^{xi} (summer semester 2010) should really be one of the largest TNE providers in Germany.

5 What is 'German' about these projects? Features of the connection with Germany

A connection with Germany may be established through the German language, extended visits to Germany or contact with Germans (other students, teachers, during work experience). Course structures, contents and design also convey, in an implicit way, approaches, the ideal of linking teaching and research and the role model of the autonomous student. The precondition for gaining the interest and commitment of everyone involved is that students who take advantage of courses offered abroad are made aware of the connection with Germany. Apart from the fact that their course is being offered by a German university, there are a lot of other features that establish the connection with Germany.

Typical characteristics of the **German system of higher education** are a strong emphasis on the unity of research and teaching, an explicit awareness of the freedom of teaching and research, academic self-government involving all members of the university, the ideal of the independent, involved student who engages in critical debate, as well as an early introduction of students to research and practice. In addition to the **curricula**, which are developed and monitored according to the quality standards of German universities, these are the features that most clearly argue for the 'German' quality of 'exported' courses.

One obvious connection with Germany is the **use of the German language**. At some universities and in some courses, German is a language of instruction, whilst in many others the students learn German to prepare for work placements and studying in Germany, for example. In this context, German is an important key to a deeper understanding of German culture and the precondition for advanced study or employment in Germany.

Study visits to Germany (language and laboratory courses, participation in summer academies, a semester abroad or a work placement in Germany) are also features of the connection with Germany that, depending

The connection with Germany is intrinsic to the TNE courses offered abroad: it is the reason for interest in these TNE offers and the engine that motivates everyone involved.

INFO BOX

Who benefits how from 'education export'?

German universities

- increase their national and international visibility and pulling power – as collaborative partners for universities and business.
- spur their internationalisation at home.
- recruit highly-qualified students and junior researchers abroad.
- use TNE to experiment with new models and organisational forms.

Foreign partners

- import curricular as well as organisational and administrative know-how.
- receive support in implementing national education targets.

Germany

- internationalises its knowledge resources.
- enhances its international appeal as a destination for study and research.
- fulfils important development policy, foreign cultural policy and education policy targets through 'education export'.

on duration, will generate more or less intensive connections with Germany. Other opportunities include **contacts with Germans** in the students' own countries, e.g. German students or people working for German companies there, as well as attending German cultural events.

German teaching staff establish a special connection with Germany irrespective of the language of instruction they use: German faculty communicate the German mentality, approaches to research questions and teaching, the way students are treated and, along the way, information about German universities and Germany in general.

Alumni and the degrees they have obtained from respected German universities carry this prestige with them to their own countries and observe the concomitant impact on their employment opportunities. Finally, **certain fields and themes** are specifically associated with Germany, such as the environment, cars, engineering science and archaeology.

6. What are the benefits of 'education export' ...?

Partnership-based 'education export' benefits both German and foreign universities and bands together the internationalisation of German universities, German interests, and education policy needs in the host countries.

From the start of TNE activities, 'education export' has been linked to the question of what all the stakeholders have to gain from it. In order to answer this question it is necessary to identify the individual factors within a cause and effect network. The implications of complex phenomena like the internationalisation of universities can only partly be expressed in figures.

a. ... for German universities?

Internationalisation of universities describes a comprehensive process "of integrating an international, intercultural or global dimension into the purpose, functions and delivery of post-secondary education".^{xii} In 2010, Professor Margret Wintermantel, at that time President of the German Rectors' Conference (HRK) and today's President of the DAAD, elucidated the arguments in favour of internationalising German universities by 'education export':

"The added value of German higher education opportunities abroad has many aspects: universities emphasise, above all, that they enable them to recruit highly-qualified students and junior researchers and to extend research and teaching collaborations. And if the universities are represented at strategically important places abroad they can play an even more active role in developing norms and benchmarks for the global science system. At the same time, an internationally active university is an extremely attractive partner both for German and for local business."^{xiii}

Four different aspects are mentioned: reputation, recruitment, contacts with potential sources of third-party funding and impact on the development of standards in international science systems. Firstly, engagement in TNE activities enhances the international **visibility** and **pulling power** of the 'exporting' university. Secondly, this has a positive effect on the university's efforts to gain the loyalty of well-qualified students, junior researchers and alumni. Whilst this **recruitment option** is normally restricted to the region in which the higher education opportunity is located, it can be very beneficial none the less in terms of the 'exporting' university's strategic focus. As an example: 32 students who took their Bachelor's at the University of Paderborn's Chinese-German Technical Faculty (CDTF) in Qingdao are currently studying for a Master's degree in Paderborn. Other graduates of CDTF have chosen Munich, Karlsruhe, Darmstadt and so on for their Master's courses. In 2009, at least five Chinese graduates embarked on doctorates at Paderborn or other German universities after completing their Master's. The project coordinator responsible for the German University in Cairo (GUC) estimates that some 250 to 300 GUC graduates are currently doing Master's or doctoral degrees in Germany, 60 to 70 of them at the Universities of Stuttgart and Ulm alone. In this context, a particular advantage for universities is that they can target and select students at an early stage as they already know them from their own courses abroad.

Maintaining an international presence also facilitates **collaboration** with universities in other countries. Universities are increasingly examining the potential amongst interesting partners to collaborate on joint research programmes across the worldwide research and education landscape. Companies, which are becoming ever more global, also play an important role in this respect: they are the ones who in collaboration with universities can generate ideas and create close links between commercial and 'education export'. In countries and regions in which Germany has economic interests or in which German companies are strongly represented, 'education export' offers these companies the opportunity to recruit local graduates who have been trained according to German standards. And vice versa: universities are able to offer demand-oriented training with good employment prospects for graduates.

By participating in the international education market universities are able to **familiarise themselves with international practice**. Project leaders gain insights into the workings of universities, their structures, processes and cooperation with other countries, and are able to use the knowledge they have acquired through active participation to generate synergy effects for their own institutions. They thus contribute to internationalising German universities.

Furthermore, TNE activities also give German universities a chance to test new models and organisational forms for their courses in terms of curriculum, financing and legal matters. Due to the limited period of (public) funding, TNE forces universities to think economically and sustainably with regard to their courses and the available funding programmes. Many German universities, for example, gained their first experiences with charging tuition fees or with **Bachelor's/Master's structures** in TNE

DAAD Position Paper

activities, and it is in the context of 'education export', especially in large-scale projects, that universities and universities of applied sciences (*Fachhochschulen*) started to launch first collaborations only short time ago – a constellation which has hardly been attempted in Germany itself so far.

German degree courses or full-scale campuses abroad are a feature of German universities' international profile and have become a component of their internationalisation strategy. Germany has positioned itself in the TNE world through its activities and creates additional visible 'showcases' and 'beacons' with large-scale projects, such as TU Berlin's engagement in El Gouna, Egypt, or the establishment of a Turkish-German University (TGU) in Istanbul.

b. ... for foreign partners?

From the point of view of host countries, 'education export' is **knowledge import**. This is true of both course contents and academic administrative procedures. Emerging economies and developing countries in particular not only face difficulties in providing sufficient numbers of university places, they also face the need to improve the quality of courses, teaching, research, and university administration. For these reasons, German universities are often seen as interesting partners whose **input** might help other countries **to modernise or reform their own higher education landscape**. These countries welcome the engagement of foreign partners in developing university structures and in capacity building amongst young scientists and junior researchers to help implement their educational objectives on a sustainable basis.

Host countries consciously embrace German education programmes and institutions as a counterbalance to the dominance of Anglo-Saxon TNE degree courses. The strengths of the German higher education system, especially the model of practice-related training at *Fachhochschulen*, are imported in order to develop domestic structures, as illustrated by the German-Jordanian University (GJU) in Amman. The partnership approach, which takes account of the education interests and traditions of the host countries, is seen as a win-win situation for both sides.

c. ... for Germany?

In a closely connected world, political themes are closely connected with one another, too, and can only be considered in isolation to a certain extent. Transnational education is located at the **interface of science policy, foreign cultural and educational policy as well as development cooperation**.

Germany has a vital interest in continuing to develop knowledge as a resource and to use it to ensure technological progress, economic growth and employment. Transnational university courses are a response to the growing multicultural and multilingual demands of a globally connected and interacting knowledge society as well as globally operating companies. The internationalization of universities is an indispensable precondition for meeting these demands. Universities have to face the challenge of

competition on the international education market and be dynamic and innovative in optimising their courses and research.

German degree courses abroad recruit qualified students and doctoral candidates for Germany and generate modern, expanded career models through brain circulation. Due to demographic developments, Germany is dependent on the immigration of qualified specialists. University partnerships and collaborative projects involving Germany abroad open up access to important partners and alumni.

Thanks to their visibility on the international education market, TNE activities also prove to be an excellent marketing tool for Germany as a location for higher education and science. In contrast to flyers and higher education fairs, German degree courses abroad permanently demonstrate their value on the spot. Contact with German professors and curricula, learning German as a foreign language, or study visits to Germany as part of their courses motivate students in TNE courses to continue their education or seek employment in Germany. These students then become marketing multipliers who enjoy a high level of credibility amongst their families and friends.

Furthermore, the activities of German universities abroad are also relevant in terms of development policy. The Federal Government's internationalisation strategy of February 2008 envisages transnational education as a measure to achieve the defined strategic goal of "sustainably strengthening cooperation with developing countries in education, research and development":

"Cooperation in the area of initial and continuing training is reviewed and coordinated on the basis of development goals and existing instruments for individual support (fellowships), institutional cooperation between education institutions, education marketing and export promotion for German training programmes."^{xiv}

TNE activities have a developmental impact in a number of ways. On the one hand, they provide new, high-quality degree courses in developing countries with capacity bottlenecks in higher education and thus contribute to **capacity building**. On the other, German university projects abroad give stimuli for modernising higher education structures and offer models for updating curricula, creating a connection to practice, and enhancing the relevance of degree courses for the employment market. The quality assurance measures that are applied to TNE projects may also have an exemplary function and thus a positive impact on the respective country's higher education system. Hence, educational investment in developing countries is also recorded in the **Official Development Assistance (ODA) quota**, which the official representatives of the EU Member States agreed to set at a target of 0.7 per cent of gross national income in May 2005.

Traditionally, Germany has considered foreign cultural and educational policy as the third pillar of its foreign policy. Gaining 'friends for Germany' who will get to know

DAAD Position Paper

and appreciate German culture and the way of life are declared goals. Under the heading of 'soft power' or 'public diplomacy' this theme is currently experiencing a boom across the globe: One example is the ongoing debate on increasing public diplomacy activities in the USA. The People's Republic of China, too, emphasises soft power through its Confucius Institutes which, similar to the German Goethe Institutes, are designed to disseminate knowledge of Chinese culture and language in the world. However, none of the major education 'exporters' – Australia, the UK and the USA – exploits the potential of transnational education as an element of foreign policy to the extent that Germany does: the UK and the USA leave it to their universities to take the initiative and Australian policy, so far, has largely focussed on the financial benefits of 'education export' for its universities.

7. The future of TNE

With their long-term, collaborative TNE activities German universities are in a position to enhance the international education landscape with a lasting effect

When considering the future of TNE activities the question arises as to whether the demand will remain constant once the classic education import countries have developed their own capacities sufficiently to be able to cover their needs on their own. Universities in the Asian region are in fact beginning to act as TNE providers themselves. Malaysian universities are particularly active and, since 2009, have been intensifying cooperation with universities in the Arab world. On the other hand, Malaysia has been making efforts to encourage higher education institutions in China and Hong Kong to engage in Malaysia. Consequently, it may be more apposite to speak of a diversification of national education markets.

Whilst universities in Asian countries are now acting as TNE providers themselves, countries like Brazil and South Africa increasingly criticise western dominance in the globalisation of education. Germany's partnership approach gains significance in this context.

Finally, there are countries like Brazil and South Africa that tend to criticise education import on principle. On the one hand, they fear that the overwhelming competition created by the import of degree courses could destroy efforts to develop and extend their own university systems. On the other, they look on TNE as a new form of colonialism designed to siphon off knowledge resources to the 'old world'. In his essay on "International Education: Alternatives to the Market", Sir Peter Scott, former Vice Chancellor of Kingston University London, considers the internationalisation of universities in the light of globalisation. He warns that globalisation has its losers as well as its winners:

"For some institutions, especially the most successful universities in the West, the trend offers equally glittering opportunities – new research collaborations with like-minded universities in other countries, the prestige of global-university league tables (...), an alternative income stream if state funding is constrained, and even a new model of entrepreneurialism extendable to the rest of the university. For other institutions, of course, globalization is a threat: their acad-

mic vitality is sucked out as their most-promising researchers move abroad and their institutional norms (even their national values) are called into question, as teams from various global agencies prescribe market policies and proscribe alternative strategies."^{xv}

Set in motion by these and similar ideas, the following paradigm change can be observed in the implementation of TNE projects. In addition to Germany, the Anglo-Saxon countries have also discovered strategic-collaborative partnerships and are integrating the national needs and interests of their partners into their TNE activities. The call for national strategies is getting louder; cross-border measures for basic issues (quality assurance, recognition issues etc.) are being demanded.

German universities, with their partnership approach, are the pioneers of this development. They have many years' experience and maintain good collaborative relations in developing joint programmes, even with South Africa and Brazil.

So far, TNE activities around the world have largely been unregulated. The time has now come to consolidate the German TNE approach into a strategy, to refine the models and programmes and to establish joint guidelines for education 'made in Germany'. A codex formulating German universities' own understanding of their role as TNE providers and naming minimum standards that can be implemented in various political contexts and under differing general conditions could significantly strengthen trust in the education opportunities offered by Germany.

Up to now, German universities' TNE activities have been more or less unregulated. Looking to the future, the German TNE approach should be strengthened and codified in guidelines for education 'made in Germany'.

8. Key performance criteria for the success of TNE projects

Based on experience from many years of activity in the field of German higher education projects abroad, the DAAD has drawn up ten key criteria which crucially influence the success or failure of TNE projects. On principle, they can be seen as relevant for all TNE projects (according to the definition used in this paper). Depending on the type and focus of the project under consideration, however, it may make sense to weight the points differently in individual cases. The criteria have been formulated with regard to projects that are not led by consortia, but, by analogy, largely apply to these, too. Hence, the ten points can serve

INFO BOX

Performance criteria for TNE projects:

- knowledge of general conditions in the host country
- good integration of the project within the home institution
- professional project management
- sustainable and secure financing
- clear agreements on collaboration with foreign partners
- quality of teaching and quality assurance measures according to the standards of the home institution
- transparent information
- sustainable human resource base
- targeted connection with Germany

DAAD Position Paper

as initial guidelines for universities considering active engagement in transnational education. For the near future, the DAAD sees a need to extend these guidelines in consultation with the universities in respect of quality standards for the TNE sector, which could serve to create a certificate of quality or approval for German degree courses and campuses abroad.²

1. Clarifying general conditions

To reach a balanced, fact-based decision on such a major commitment as a TNE project abroad, it is necessary to clarify the general conditions. This implies, in particular, a market analysis investigating the need for the course to be offered, a regional analysis covering all relevant points (school system and leaving certificates, academic aptitude, native language and foreign languages, teaching and learning tradition etc.), an examination of the legal framework (approval, recognition etc.) and a feasibility study investigating, amongst other things, the 'exporting' university's existing resources (finances, staff etc.).

TNE projects should conform to the university's strategic focus and be integrated in its internal structures and processes.

2. Integrating TNE projects in the home institution

The commitment to develop and offer a course abroad is a commitment made by the entire university, not just the project leader and his or her institute. The project should reflect the university's strategic focus and conform to the measures outlined in its internationalisation strategy. It is also important to integrate the project in the structures and processes of the home university: even courses run abroad should be subject to the usual committees, included in the university's quality assurance measures, and receive support from the responsible units in the university administration with regard to legal, staffing, admissions and collaboration issues.

3. Managing TNE projects professionally

In order to develop a course, not to mention a faculty or a full-scale university abroad, professional project management is required. Experienced personnel must either be appointed or existing personnel trained for the purpose. Clearly-defined tasks and procedures are just as important as setting milestones and financial planning, which should be regularly monitored and, if necessary, adjusted.

4. Secure financing

Financing for a course abroad must be secured for several years. Financial planning should take into account potential risks caused by fluctuations in exchange rates and the options/requirements pertaining to international money transfers. Especially for the period immediately following the cessation of public funding, plans must be made to ensure financial independence based, for example, on tuition fees, third-party funding etc., or applications submitted for follow-up funding. It must be guaranteed that students taking the course abroad will be able to complete their degree in due fashion should the project (have to) be broken off.

5. Formulating collaboration with the foreign partner

Collaboration should be based on partnership and transparency and should respect the partners' different cultural contexts. A cooperation agreement which clearly states the respective rights and duties of both partners is essential. In addition to the statement of work, the agreement should, in particular, also contain regulations relating to the charging/distribution of tuition fees and to a potential premature cessation of cooperation. The 'exporting' institution should ensure that its logo is used and its intellectual property rights to the course are observed. It should also verify that its course abroad can be conducted with its partner on the basis of minimum academic and administrative standards. Furthermore, it is important that a steering committee with defined decision-making powers should be appointed for the joint project, if possible with equal representation of both sides in order to guarantee the participation and influence of the German partner.

6. Guaranteeing the quality of teaching

It must be ensured that the quality of the course offered abroad to the greatest possible extent corresponds to that of comparable courses at the university in Germany. This refers to the admission requirements, curricula, conditions of study, selection of teaching staff as well as to the question of local research opportunities. In this context, the issue of the language of instruction should be considered. It should be clear in advance what legal provisions the university can and wishes to use to employ German academic teaching staff abroad and pay them appropriately. The need for accreditation depends on the requirements of the respective host country; however, accreditation according to recognised international or German standards is recommended. The course should lead to a German and/or other recognised degree.

The course offered abroad must largely correspond to comparable courses at the university in Germany and lead to a recognised degree.

7. Carrying out quality assurance measures

The quality of the course abroad should be subject to the same quality assurance measures that are applied to courses at the university in Germany (e.g. teaching evaluation, graduate destination surveys). It must be guaranteed that the results of the measures taken are appropriately incorporated in course development.

8. Providing transparent information

The 'exporting' university should provide clear, easily accessible information on admission regulations, curricular contents and requirements, conditions of study, student mentoring, academic fees and the degrees it awards. Particular emphasis should be placed on information that allows potential students to assess the quality of the course (accreditation, status of the home university, recognition of degrees). In doing so it should be borne in mind that students abroad have a different information background; this should also be taken into account in marketing and public outreach activities.

Information on admission regulations as well as on conditions of study and curricula should be tailored to the needs of foreign students.

9. Ensuring sustained staff engagement

A critical element affecting the success of any TNE project is the continuing willingness of German lecturers to teach abroad. This can be achieved by appropriate legal and financial provisions. Together with the university's Personnel and Legal Departments, acceptable solutions can be found for everyone involved. It is important that the project is institutionally linked to and safeguarded in Germany so that the project does not have to be curtailed if a project leader leaves (due to retirement, for example). It benefits sustainability if academic teaching staff from the partner country are involved in the course from the very beginning and their share of the teaching constantly increases (e.g. up to 80 per cent). To prepare for this, continuing education and so-called 'train the trainer' courses for local personnel should be employed.

From the beginning, faculty from the partner country should be involved in teaching alongside teaching staff from the German university

10. Elucidating the connection with Germany

The degree course abroad should be clearly recognisable as a German university's course. This can be achieved in various different ways, e.g. through course contents, study visits to Germany, the connection between teaching and practice or teaching and research, through opportunities for student participation or by using German as a language of instruction.^{xvi} The measures to strengthen the connection with Germany should be chosen in accordance with the project's strategic goals. If students are being trained for the local employment market, for example, practice-related training would be more useful than learning German. If students are supposed to be recruited for a (German language) Master's course in Germany when they have finished their local Bachelor's, advanced German language skills should be taught.

9. The role of the DAAD

The DAAD has core competencies in the field of transnational education which it applies to projects in its role as sponsor and service provider. It is funder and advisory point for universities and, thanks to years of experience, also has the expertise to undertake project management for TNE projects in its own right.

Thanks to its history of experience with transnational education projects, the DAAD can quickly identify critical developments and appropriate countermeasures.

The DAAD is a **funding recipient for public** and, to a minor extent, private **funders** and, **at the same time, funding provider** for universities as applicants for project support: it administers and audits public funding in accordance with national funding legislation, draws up funding agreements, allocates the corresponding funds, controls the use of funds in line with the purpose of funding and, if applicable, demands repayment from the funding recipient.

The **DAAD** is the **guarantor of quality goals and procedures**. It has established a comprehensive quality assurance procedure which starts with the selection of projects by independent selection committees of experts and continues with regular project

monitoring and evaluation. With more than ten years' experience with various higher education projects abroad, an enormous wealth of experience has been gathered both in the selection committees and at the DAAD itself which enables it to identify critical developments quickly and recommend countermeasures. In this context, the **DAAD** clearly differentiates between knowledge about project management and administrative processes on the one side and academic contents on the other. **It leaves the decision as to whether academic contents are meaningful to the academic community** by appointing the appropriate specialists to selection committees and evaluation teams and allocating responsibility for course curricula to the universities themselves.

In addition, the DAAD entrusts the **evaluation** of certain approved projects to independent reviewers and even subjects entire funding programmes and programme areas to critical evaluation.

As a "**Competence centre for project advice and funding for transnational education**", the **DAAD** offers services for German and foreign universities and education providers. Both nationally and internationally, the DAAD is increasingly being perceived as an information and advisory centre for project development and management. The aggregated **project know-how and the information gleaned from observing and analysing competitors on the international education market** flow together at the DAAD. This knowledge is complemented by the **regional expertise** that the DAAD has built up in its country and regional departments and in its global network. 14 regional offices, 51 information centres and a network of some 470 lectors ensure that the DAAD always has up-to-the-minute, first-hand knowledge of science policy issues, used both to provide strategy advice for interested universities and as an information base for political decision-makers. Information is disseminated in publications, at specialist conferences and networking meetings. Furthermore, the DAAD identifies where there is a need for further training for those involved in the projects and develops options for targeted training.

The DAAD is a **project management agency**: it uses its regional and project expertise to provide advice on contents as well as on management and financial administration issues. In this context, the DAAD functions as a mediator between the strategic and operative project levels and contributes its procedural expertise. Funding management by the DAAD guarantees professional use and control of funding, obviates the necessity for additional administrative structures, and facilitates content-related synergies. Thanks to its experience, the DAAD is able to design quality processes and to conduct project management in its own right. This is already happening in varying degrees in large-scale projects, for example the Turkish-German University (TDU) for which the DAAD acts as head office for a consortium of German universities.

The DAAD does not only advise German and foreign universities and education providers but manages projects in its own right.

The DAAD is a reliable, independent partner for foreign universities or university organisations: For information and advice, for establishing and facilitating contacts

DAAD Position Paper

right through to project collaborations, the DAAD is often the first port of call and long-standing link for foreign partners. For them the DAAD is the guarantor of reliability, continuity and objectivity. And, on top of this, the DAAD is seen as the preserver of continuity, the entity that will help projects through difficult phases, such as staff turnover. The realisation that such phases will not risk the partial loss of project knowledge strengthens foreign partners' trust in their collaboration with German universities.

For comprehensive TNE projects like the establishment of a university abroad, universities often join forces to form consortia – the DAAD takes on the role of moderator.

The DAAD acts as an **organiser and moderator for German university consortia**. Especially when a TNE project entails setting up an entire university or other large-scale project, many individual university partners are unable to cope on their own with the commitments involved in collaboration and teaching, or the capacity and responsibility required. This option is open only for large universities like RWTH Aachen University, which supports the development of the German University of Technology (GUTech) in the Sultanate of

Oman, or Technische Universität München (TUM) with its affiliated German Institute of Science and Technology — TUM Asia. Otherwise, consortia are an amalgamative format that provides an organisational structure for collaboration between several university partners. This allows even smaller universities to take part in TNE activities. However, the division of labour usually practised by consortia requires an additional organisational level. This is where the DAAD is needed as a moderator between the various ideas and procedures of the universities involved – both in Germany and abroad.

Annotations

- ¹ This is the English translation of a position paper first published in German in 2012.
 - ² Following a joint initiative of DAAD and the German Rectors' Conference (HRK), the HRK adopted the „Code of Conduct for Higher Education Projects Abroad“ in May 2013, about a year after the first publication of this position paper; cf. <http://www.hrk.de/resolutions-publications/resolutions/resolution/convention/code-of-conduct-for-german-higher-education-projects-abroad/>
-
- ⁱ Cf. CDU, CSU and FDP (2009) „Growth. Education. Cohesion – Coalition Agreement between CDU, CSU and FDP. 17th legislative period“, p. 66
 - ⁱⁱ Cf. The Observatory on Borderless Higher Education (2008) „Borderless Higher Education 'Down Under': Quality Assurance of Australian Cross-Border Initiatives“, p. 3 ff.
 - ⁱⁱⁱ Cf., for example, the definitions of 'cross-border education' (UNESCO/ OECD (2005) „Guidelines for Quality Provision in Cross-border Higher Education“, p. 7), 'offshore education' (Australian Vice-Chancellors' Committee (2005) „Provision of Education to International Students – Code of Practice and Guidelines for Australian Universities“, p. 3) und 'transnational education' (Council of Europe (2002) „Code of Good Practice in the Provision of Transnational Education“, Document No. DGIV/EDU/HE (2002) 8, Section 1)
 - ^{iv} Cf. Schreiterer, Ulrich and Witte, Johanna (2001) „Models and Scenarios for the Export of German Courses Abroad. A comparative international study“, Gütersloh, p. 38
 - ^v Cf. the following section on „Types of TNE activity“
 - ^{vi} Lanzendorf, Ute (2008) „Foreign-Backed Universities: A New Trend“ in: International Higher Education, No. 51, Spring 2008, p. 5
 - ^{vii} Ibid., p. 4
 - ^{viii} Ibid., p.3
 - ^{ix} With the exception joint and double degree programmes which are not considered in the scope of this paper (cf. section on „What is Transnational Education? – A definition“)
 - ^x Cf. Schreiterer and Witte, op.cit., p. 62 ff.
 - ^{xi} According to: www.fernuni-hagen.de/universitaet/profil/zahlen/index.shtml on 14.10.2010
 - ^{xii} Knight, Jane (2003) „Updating the Definition of Internationalization“ in: International Higher Education, No. 33, Fall 2003, p. 2
 - ^{xiii} German Academic Exchange Service (ed.) (2010) „Hochschulbildung ohne Grenzen – Projekte deutscher Hochschulen im Ausland. Informationen – Beispiele – Meinungsbilder“, Bonn p. 8
 - ^{xiv} Federal Ministry of Education and Research (2008) „Strengthening Germany's Role in the Global Knowledge Society – Strategy of the Federal Government for the Internationalisation of Science and Research“, p. 22, <http://www.bmbf.de/pub/Internationalisierungsstrategie-English.pdf>
 - ^{xv} Scott, Peter (2010) „International Education: Alternatives to the Market“ in: International Higher Education, No. 61, Autumn 2010, p. 3
 - ^{xvi} Cf. section on „What is German about these projects? – Features of the connection with Germany“ for additional examples

SPONSORED BY THE



Federal Ministry
of Education
and Research

DAAD
Deutscher Akademischer Austauschdienst
German Academic Exchange Service
Kennedyallee 50
53175 Bonn
www.daad.de

Bereich Transnationale Bildung und Kooperationsprogramme
Division Transnational Education and Cooperation Programmes

tnb@daad.de

www.daad.de/tnb