A guide to results-oriented project planning and monitoring

Table of Contents

1. Introduction	. 1
2. The function of results frameworks and indicators	. 1
3. Key terms and definitions	
3.2. Indicators	
4. Results framework for the "German-Bangladesh University Cooperation in the Textile and Clothing Sector 2018-2019"	
5. Indicators for the "German-Bangladesh University Cooperation in the Textile and Clothing Sector 2018 -2019"	
6. Information on results-oriented project planning	11

1. Introduction

As a learning organisation, the DAAD is committed to working with higher education institutions, funding bodies, and other partners to continually improve the achievement of objectives and the implementation of its programmes. DAAD programmes funded by the Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung, BMZ) are therefore supported by a results-oriented monitoring system (RoM). The collection and evaluation of monitoring data enables the DAAD and the higher education institutions to better understand results and impacts. Thus, conclusions can be drawn for the design and further development of programmes and their successful implementation. Results-oriented management is based on a continuous learning process. This aims to further enhance the effectiveness of the action of all parties involved regarding development policy. Results-oriented monitoring also supports transparency and accountability with respect to funding bodies, the public, and partners in Germany and abroad. Consequently, the DAAD is able to take account of both the international discourse relating to the Aid Effectiveness Agenda and also the provisions of the Federal Budget Code regarding performance monitoring in the use of public funds.

2. The function of results frameworks and indicators

A results framework is a core reference document for the results-oriented planning and management of projects and programmes. Combined with indicators, it forms the basis for monitoring and evaluation.

- A results framework demonstrates and visualises the funding logic of a project or programme. It clarifies the relationships between the contributions of the various stakeholders, the activities, the intended short and medium-term results, and the medium and long-term objectives and impacts.
- Indicators are assigned to the activities, results, and objectives described in the results framework. These indicators allow the implemented activities and the intended results and objectives to be measured.

 Results frameworks and indicators are the basis for the results-oriented planning and reporting of projects. Thus, they are decisive for a systematic assessment of the extent to which objectives have been implemented and achieved by means of a comparison between target and actual performance. This is the basis for the results-oriented management of a project or programme and its further development in dialogue between the partners involved.

3. Key terms and definitions

3.1. Results framework

In a results framework, the higher-level development policy objectives (**impacts**) are formulated. The direct project/programme goals (**outcomes**) should contribute towards achieving these impacts. The project/programme goals are achieved when the results produced (**outputs**) are used by the target group. The results, in turn, are derived from the **activities and measures** of a project/programme, which are made possible through the use of resources (**inputs**).

The BMZ and DAAD base their definition of the different impact levels on the OECD/DAC definitions¹:

Impacts: Positive and negative, primary and secondary long-term effects produced by a development intervention, directly or indirectly, intended or unintended.

Impacts are the intended higher-level development policy goals, towards which a contribution is to be made in the long term through a development intervention, e.g. a contribution towards the structural reinforcement of teaching at the partner institutions or towards the internationalisation of the higher education institutions. The impacts observed at this level in turn contribute towards overarching objectives, such as the creation of outstanding, cosmopolitan higher education institutions, and towards sustainable development in general. Impacts are usually reviewed by means of evaluations (often ex-post), not as part of monitoring.

Outcomes: The anticipated or achieved short-term and medium-term effects of an intervention's outputs.

Outcomes are the intended effects that result from use of the outputs for the target group (= benefits for the target group). The programme objectives are formulated at this level. Outcomes are, for example, newly developed degree courses at the partner institutions, which reflect the latest developments in science and suit the local context, or established development-related, specialist networks between the participating universities and other institutions.

Outputs: The products, capital goods, and services which result from a development intervention; may also include changes resulting from the intervention which are relevant to the achievement of outcomes.

Outputs are all the products, services, and results developed and/or provided through an intervention required to achieve the intended outcomes. Outputs are, for example,

¹ Cf. OECD/DAC (2009): Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results Based Management. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/dcdndep/43184177.pdf [1.7.2016].

jointly developed curricula or teaching modules compiled within projects, the creation of structural conditions for degree courses at the partner universities, or the expansion and consolidation of contacts. Outputs also include personal skills gained or knowledge transmitted.

Activities: Actions taken or work performed through which inputs, such as funds, [..] assistance, and other types of resources are mobilized to produce specific outputs.

These include project-specific activities and measures, e.g. the organisation of events, further and continuing education activities, project-related visits, and the development/revision or acquisition of teaching/learning materials and consumables.

Inputs: The financial, human, and material resources used for the development intervention.

Inputs are all the material and non-material resources involved in a project, e.g. the financial and personnel resources supplied by the DAAD, the higher education institutions, and other partners, where applicable, as well as specialist expertise and infrastructure.

3.2. Indicators

Indicators are assigned to the activities, outputs, and outcomes listed in the results framework; they are used for specification and measurement. An indicator is a value that can be measured empirically, providing information about a construct that cannot be measured directly.

According to the OECD/DAC, an indicator is defined as follows:

Quantitative or qualitative factor or variable that provides a simple and reliable means to measure achievement to reflect the changes connected to an intervention or to help assess the performance of a development actor.²

The selection of conclusive indicators requires a number of minimum standards. Firstly, an indicator has to measure the actual issues it ultimately ought to measure (validity). Secondly, repeated tests and measurements should – given that the conditions remain the same – always lead to the same results (reliability). Aside of these methodological requirements the indicators also need to follow practical requirements. They should thus be chosen in consideration of the given circumstances, such as resources and capacities (practicability) on the one hand and acceptance of the people concerned on the other hand (acceptance). Meaningful indicators ought to define precise target values (benchmarks). These targets specify firstly, the measures which should be deployed and secondly the specific timeframe.

The SMART criteria are a useful guide towards the implementation of these requirements.:

Specific: Precise and unambiguous in terms of quality and quantity

(Who? What? How?)

Measurable: Can be measured with reasonable effort and at reasonable cost

Attainable: Objectives are realistically achievable within the specified parameters

² Cf. OECD/DAC (2009): Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results Based Management. Available online at: http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/dcdndep/43184177.pdf [20.7.2016].

Relevant: Meaningful in terms of the intended changes

Time-bound: Has a defined timeframe

More information:

Federal Ministry for Economic Cooperation and Development (Bundesministerium für wirtschaftliche Zusammenarbeit und Entwicklung) (2006): Evaluation criteria for German bilateral development cooperation.

[http://www.bmz.de/de/zentrales downloadarchiv/erfolg und kontrolle/evaluierungskriterien.pdf; Date: 12.09.2016]

Meyer, Wolfgang (2004): Indikatorenentwicklung: Eine praxisorientierte Einführung. [http://ceval.de/modx/fileadmin/user_upload/PDFs/workpaper10.pdf; Date: 12.09.2016]

OECD/DAC (2009): Glossary of Key Terms in Evaluation and Results Based Management. [http://www.oecd.org/dac/evaluation/dcdndep/43184177.pdf; Date: 12.09.2016]

Phineo (2013): Kursbuch Wirkung. Das Praxishandbuch für alle, die Gutes noch besser tun wollen. [https://www.phineo.org/fileadmin/phineo/2 Publikationen/Kursbuch/PHINEO KURSBUCH_WIRKUNG_low.pdf; Date: 12.09.2016]



4. Results framework for the "German-Bangladesh University Cooperation in the Textile and Clothing Sector 2018-2019"

The impact network for the German-Bangladesh University Cooperation programme was developed on the basis of the impact matrix agreed with the GIZ and the BMZ. It forms the reference framework for the promotion of individual university projects stipulated by DAAD.

On the **impact level**, the German-Bangladeshi University Cooperation programme will contribute to the sustainable development and expansion of high-performance and cosmopolitan universities in Germany and the partner countries. In order to achieve this, teaching at the partner universities should be structurally strengthened and existing cooperation structures between the participating universities and institutions - and the private sector - should be stabilised. At the same time, the programme is intended to help the German universities make a contribution to development cooperation as qualified partners, and the universities should be supported in their internationalisation strategies.

In order to contribute to these long-term effects (impacts), the programme pursues four **programme objectives (outcomes)**:

- 1. Partner universities offer **practice-oriented** studies that reflect the local context and the latest academic developments.
- 2. The **needs-based orientation of research** carried out by participating faculties is intensified.
- Networks with development-relevant professional and regional focal points, and which
 are characterised by North-South, South-South or North-South-South partner structures, should be established between the participating universities and the private sector.
- 4. Through their participation in the programme, German universities should acquire **expertise in development cooperation** so that they can make a long-term contribution to development cooperation as partners. Therefore, at universities, development-relevant issues should be increasingly dealt with in lectures, publications or seminar papers, for example.

In order to achieve this, practice-oriented curricula and/or teaching modules that reflect the local context and the latest academic developments will be jointly developed at the **output level** in the projects in the German-Bangladeshi University Cooperation programme. In addition, the teaching staff at the partner universities should be professionally and didactically qualified. Needs-oriented research projects will be carried out. In order to establish development-relevant networks, individual contacts between the participating universities and institutions, as well as the private sector, should be expanded and consolidated.

In order to realise these outputs, various **activities** can be performed by the participating universities and institutions. For example, expenditure on the realisation of continuing education and training, workshops, project-related residences and the development/revision or procurement of teaching/learning materials, consumables and small appliances (cf. Appendix - Funding framework) are eligible.

Inputs (resources) are contributed by the main actors for the implementation of university projects. DAAD provides programme resources, expertise and advice; applicant universities and, where appropriate, other partners, provide personnel and financial resources, expertise, and infrastructure.

Output (direct short- and medium term **Impact Activities** (products, services, changes) impacts) (longer-term impacts on development) Input Practice-oriented curric-The quality of practice-oriula/teaching modules, Teaching materials, consumaented teaching on sewhich reflect the local conbles, small appliances, etc. The programme contriblected Bangladeshi study text and the latest acarelevant to the implementautes to the structural courses with relevance to demic developments, are tion of the project are develstrengthening of teaching responsible company (further) developed collaboped/revised or acquired. and research at partner management in the textile Inputs of the DAAD (prooratively universities gramme resources, expertise and clothing sector is imand consultation) proved The programme contributes to Teaching staff at partner sustainable development universities have profes-Events are held The needs-based orientasional and didactic qualifition of research carried out cations by participating faculties is Inputs of universities (own re-The programme helps to intensified sources, staff, expertise, infrastabilise cooperation strucstructure) The programme helps to build tures between the participowerful and cosmopolitan pating universities and in-Continuing education and Needs-oriented research is reauniversities stitutions training are carried out lized Development-relevant pro-Inputs of other partners fessional networks between the participating universities and institutions Contact between the par-Project-related resiare established ticipating universities and dences are realised institutions is expanded and consolidated. The programme helps Ger-German universities have man universities to actively gained expertise in develcontribute as partners to opment cooperation 6 development cooperation

Outcome

5. Indicators for the "German-Bangladesh University Cooperation in the Textile and Clothing Sector 2018 -2019"

The following programme indicators have been set for the German-Bangladesh University Cooperation **programme**, and for which DAAD will request data as part of the universities' annual reports. This data is used for programme management by DAAD and the accountability of DAAD to the donor.

Activities and assigned programme indicators

Activities	Indicator
Teaching materials, consumables, small appliances, etc. relevant to the implementation of the project are developed/revised or acquired.	Expenditure on teaching materials, consumables and small appliances (in euros) (in the reporting year)
	Qualitative description of the main teaching and learning materials, consumables and equipment, as well as their usefulness in the project (in the reporting year)
Events are held	Number of events carried out (in the reporting year), differentiated according to Title/topic Venue/country Duration (in days) Format (e.g. planning/steering meetings, workshops, meetings)
	Number of participants in the events (in the reporting year), differentiated according to • Gender
Continuing education and training are carried out	Number of continuing education and training courses (in the reporting year), differentiated according to
	Number of participants in continuing education and training (in the reporting year), differentiated according to • Gender
Project-related residences are realised	Number of subsidies implemented (in the reporting year)
	Number of beneficiaries (in the reporting year), differentiated according to Gender Country of citizenship Status (e.g. BA/MA students, doctoral students, professors) Type of subsidy (new/continued funding) Duration of funding Subject group Destination country

Output	Indicator
Practice-oriented curricula/teaching modules that are appropriate to the local context and correspond to the state of science are jointly developed	Number of newly developed or revised curricula, teaching modules, courses or other courses offered (since funding began), differentiated by Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules) Title/topic New or revised Level (e.g. Bachelor, Master) Implementation status Involvement of non-university stakeholders (e.g. science/research sector, industry, politics) Number of partner institutions involved in development Indicator: for each university cooperation at least one curriculum related to social and environmental standards in the textile and clothing sector is revised in cooperation with companies in the textile and clothing sector at the end of the project Qualitative description of the curricula, teaching modules and courses developed, as well as the relevant added value for the partner university/universities (since funding began)
Lecturers at the part- ner universities are qualified in terms of the subject matter and didactics	Number of teaching staff who took part in continuing education (including doctoral candidates) (in the reporting year) Number of teaching staff who claim to have acquired relevant learning content in continuing education (follow-up questionnaire; relevance to be proven with reference to 3 specific case studies) Indicator:60% of the teaching staff (of which 33% are women), who have taken part in qualification measures to improve their didactic and specialist skills within the scope of the German-Bangladeshi university cooperation, provide evidence on the basis of three case studies from their area of responsibility that the quality of their teaching has improved
Needs-based research is conducted	Number of jointly conducted needs-based research projects within the scope of the university cooperation, differentiated according to • Topic • Faculty • Degree of implementation • Private enterprise involvement Qualitative description of needs-based aspect and benefit for target group (at least 2 research projects) Indicator: for each university cooperation, at least two joint, needs-based research projects are conducted between Bangladeshi and German universities and organised in cooperation with companies (e.g. as part of a Master's or PhD). For each university cooperation, one workshop on using the results of the research projects involving both companies and universities has taken place.

Contacts between the participating universities and other institutions are extended and consolidated

Number of newly acquired active partners drawing up, managing and/or implementing activities in the participating universities (in the reporting year), differentiated by

• Area (e.g. science/research sector, industry, politics)

Number of contacts with existing partners consolidated since funding began; differentiated by

Area (e.g. science/research sector, industry, politics)
 Indicator: The university cooperations have consolidated existing contacts with partners and established new contacts e.g. as part of coordination forums for the overall project



Outcomes and assigned program indicators

Outcome	Indicator
The quality of practice- oriented teaching on selected Bangladeshi study courses with rel- evance to responsible company management in the textile and cloth- ing sector is improved	Number of curricula, teaching modules, teaching events or other study programmes (since the start of funding) that have been agreed or already introduced and offered Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules) Title/topic New or revised Level (e.g. bachelor's, master's) Implementation status (e.g. coordinated, tested, offered) Involvement of non-university actors (e.g. business, politics) Number of partner institutions using the study offer Number of planned study places for study programmes which have been revised or newly developed (since the start of funding) with the support of the programme Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules) Number of applicants for study offers that have been revised or newly developed (since the start of funding) with the support of the programme Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules) Number of students in study programmes that have been revised or newly developed (since the start of funding) with the support of the program Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules) Number of newly created or improved processes and structures at partner universities (since the start of funding), differentiated according to: Name/brief description Field Implementation status Contribution to improvement
	Number of teachers in study programmes that have been revised or newly developed (since the start of funding) with the support of the programme • Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules)
The needs-based orientation of research carried out by participating faculties is intensified.	Number of active conference participations (in the reporting year)
	Number of publications realised as part of research projects (in the reporting year), differentiated according to
	Implementation statusType of publication
	Number of research and consultation products (in the reporting year) developed with the support of DAAD, differentiated according to
	Title/topicTypeDegree of implementation
	Qualitative description of needs-based orientation and benefit to the target group

Number of partnerships funded (in the reporting year), differentiated according Partner structure (e.g. North-South, North-South-South) Specialist focus Regional focus Number of active cooperation partners in subsidised partnerships (since the start of funding), differentiated according to Name of the institution Seat of the institution Development-relevant Field (e.g. science/research, business, politics) professional networks Type (e.g. defined in the application agreement, other partners) between the participat-Development of the partnership (e.g. unchanged, consolidated) ing universities and institutions are estab-Qualitative description of cooperation within the project (in the reporting year) lished Number of professional networks in which the subsidised universities actively participate (since the start of funding) Network name Specialist focus Regional focus Participation of non-university actors (e.g. business, politics) Central tasks of the network Added value for the project Increase in DC expertise of the project team of the German university (since the start of funding) German universities have gained expertise in development coop-Qualitative description of the extent to which German universities are ineration creasingly concerned with questions relevant to development (e.g. in lectures, seminar papers, dissertations, dissemination of publications or as part of the university strategy)

6. Information on results-oriented project planning

Project applications by universities require that they specify the impact logic and the indicators of the programme for the respective project. This is done using a **project concept** in text form and a **project planning overview**.

The activities, outputs and outcomes depicted in the program's impact network must be defined according to their own project conception and planning. The planned project must therefore state which activities or measures should be implemented in order to achieve the project-specific outputs and outcomes. This results in an impact-oriented project concept that is consistent with the programme's effectiveness.

Important note:

Individual partnerships may set different focus points within the programme's impact network. Not every partnership must contribute to all programme objectives (outcomes); however, it must contribute to improving practical teaching and to intensifying the needs-based focus of research at participating universities. Partnerships can be flexible in how they formulate and attain their objectives; however, the project objectives for this must be consistent with the programme objectives.

Based on the project conception, **each project-specific output or outcome must define 1 to 2 meaningful indicators**. The program indicators described in section 5 should be used insofar as they are relevant for concrete project planning and management. In addition, further indicators can be developed which are suitable for specifying and measuring the outputs and outcomes of the project. Indicators can be quantitative (number) and qualitative. Each indicator must be assigned with project-specific target values (value equivalence), which provide information on how much of the project should be applied, implemented and achieved. In this way, the degree of project progress and goal attainment can be checked. The project conception, value-added indicators and time schedule planning are documented in tabular form in the **project planning overview** (Appendix).

Both the relevant programme indicators and the individual project indicators defined in the universities' application form comprise the reference framework for the universities' annual reports to DAAD.

Selected examples of impact-oriented project planning and adaptation of the programme indicators to a specific project

Formulation of project indicators at output level

Example 1

Output (programme level)

Teaching staff at the partner universities are professionally and didactically qualified.

Indicator (programme level)

Number of qualified teachers (including teaching graduate students), differentiated according to

Type of qualification (e.g. professional, didactic)

Output (project level)

Teaching staff of the partner university **Bangladesh National University** are **in responsible corporate management**.

Indicator (project level)

10 university teachers of Bangladesh National University, including at least 3 women, will be qualified in responsible corporate management by the end of 2019.

Example 2

Output (programme level)

Curricula/teaching modules, which reflect the local context and the latest academic developments, are collaboratively developed.

Indicator (programme level)

Number of newly developed or revised curricula, teaching modules, teaching events or other study programmes, differentiated according to

- **Type** (e.g. curricula, teaching modules)
- Title/topic
- New or revised
- Level (e.g. bachelor's, master's)
- Implementation status (e.g. coordinated, tested, offered)
- Involvement of non-university actors (e.g. business)
- Number of partner institutions involved in development

Output (project level)

A bachelor's curriculum on the topic of responsible corporate management has been newly developed in collaboration with the Bangladesh University of Textiles in Dhaka and the NETZ Partnership for Development and Justice.

Indicator (project level)

The bachelor's curriculum on the topic of responsible corporate management, developed in collaboration with the Bangladesh University of Textile in Dhaka and the NETZ Partnership for Development and Justice has been agreed by the universities to start from the 2019 winter semester.

Formulation of project indicators at outcome level

Example 1

Outcome (programme level)

Development-relevant professional **networks** between the participating **universities and institutions** are established.

Indicator (programme level)

Number of active cooperation partners in subsidised partnerships, differentiated according to

- Institution name
- Seat of institution (DAAD key)
- Field (e.g. science/research, business, politics)
- Type (e.g. defined in the application agreement, other partners)
- Development of partnership (e.g. unchanged, consolidated)

Outcome (project level)

The "Textile Technology" partnership project with the Bangladesh University of Textiles (BUTEX) is consolidated and has active development-relevant networks with the economy.

Indicator (project level)

The collaboration of TU Freiberg with the Bangladesh University of Textiles in Dhaka is consolidated until the end of 2019.

By the end of 2019 the partnership project is to have acquired at least two regional companies based in the region as active co-operation partners.

Example 2

Outcome (programme level)

Partner universities **offer courses** that reflect the local context and current academic developments.

Indicator (programme level)

Number of students in study programmes that have been revised or newly developed with the support of the programme

Type (e.g. curricula, teaching modules)

Outcome (project level)

A newly developed bachelor's curriculum on **textile management is offered** at the Bangladesh University of Textiles in Dhaka (BUTEX).

Indicator (project level)

In the 2019 winter semester at least 20 students in the Textiles Management bachelor's degree programme at the Bangladesh University of Textiles (BUTEX) were registered in Dhaka, of which at least 33% are women.